

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N 1949

Date: 2010-01-16

REPLACES: _____

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32

Data Management and Interchange

Secretariat: United States of America (ANSI)
Administered by Farance Inc. on behalf of ANSI

DOCUMENT TYPE	Disposition of Comments
TITLE	Disposition of comments in 32N1768 Summary of Voting on CD 15944-8 Information technology - Business operational view Part 8: Identification of privacy requirements as external constraints on business transactions
SOURCE	WG1 - Jake Knoppers - project editor
PROJECT NUMBER	1.32.31.01.08.00
STATUS	Disposition of comments in 32N1768 (comments on CD 15944-8 ballot 32N1710). This accompanies FCD 15944-8 sent to NBs for 4 month letter ballot
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	FYI
REQUESTED ACTION	
DUE DATE	
Number of Pages	24
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members SC Chair WG Conveners and Secretaries

Dr. Timothy Schoechle, Secretary, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Farance Inc *, 3066 Sixth Street, Boulder, CO, United States of America
Telephone: +1 303-443-5490; E-mail: Timothy@Schoechle.org
available from the JTC 1/SC 32 WebSite <http://www.jtc1sc32.org/>
*Farance Inc. administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
CA01	All		ge	<p>1) Canada votes DISAPPROVE with comments on this CD document for 15944-8.</p> <p>Canada fully supports this standard development project.</p> <p>2) Depending on ballot comments from other JTC1/SC32 P-members and their resolution, Canada is open to the next iteration of the 15944-8 document being issued as either a CD2 or a FCD.</p> <p>Here the option of preparing a "sneak peek" FCD type document for review at the interim SC32/WG1 meeting December, 2008/January, 2009 should be considered. Such an approach will allow for the preparation of a FCD ballot document and the completion of FCD ballot comments prior to the date of the Nay/June, 2009 JTC1/SC32 Plenary.</p> <p>The rationale is that in the preparation of these CD ballot comments, Canadian experts came to the conclusion that well over 80% of the technical</p>	<p>1) It is important that at the Sydney ballot resolution meeting to address and resolve a number of key, high level issues first.</p> <p>It is anticipated that based on the decisions taken, the Sydney ballot resolution meeting, that during the Sydney meeting considerable progress can be made in applying these decisions with as objective the development of replacement text. If not, then SC32/WG1 should provide clear instructions for the development of replacement text and/or additional text as per resolution of ballot comments on this document.</p> <p>2) Canada recommends that SC32/WG1 going to an FCD, with the preparation of an "interim sneak peak" FCD type document to be reviewed and discussed at the interim SC32/WG1 meeting December,2008/January, 2009.</p> <p>3) In support of this approach, Canada also recommends that the Project Editors prepare draft text documents for Clause 7 and 8 for review and comments by SC32/WG1 members in support of</p>	Accepted: Project Editors are requested to provide a "sneak peek" document no later than November 2008	

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				<p>elements required for this Part 8 are already covered on a generic basis in existing Parts of ISO/IEC 15944 (especially its Part 1 which was developed in 1998-2002). Time and time again, throughout Part 1 in either its examples, footnotes and/or Annexes, the requirements applicable to a buyer as an "individual" were used and from the outset, 15944-1 was already architected and structurally engineered to be able to support privacy/data protection requirements. Subsequent Parts of 15944 continued to support this approach (particularly Part 5).</p> <p>In addition, Canada recognizes that there are many and varied detailed requirement pertaining to privacy protection which do need to be addressed. However, here Canada recommends that SC32/WG1 continue its successful approach on focussing and resolving the more primitive elements first before going into further levels of detail. As such, Canada has made a number of</p>	<p>the preparation of a draft "sneak peak" FCD document.</p> <p>4) Finally, in support of this approach, Canada recommends that SC32/WG1 start and maintain a standing document with the following draft title</p> <p>"eBusiness and Privacy Protection requirements to be addressed in the 2nd edition of ISO/IEC 15944-8"</p> <p>Canada also recommends that at its Sydney ballot resolution meeting for this CD document, that SC32/WG1 start such a document to capture/document SC32/WG1 decisions on ballot resolution of this nature</p>		

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				<p>comments on Clause 1.3 "Aspects currently not addressed". This will ensure a clear differentiation between that</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) which can and should be accomplished for this 1st edition; and, 2) which should be deferred for development as part of the next, i.e. 2nd edition. 3) <p>Finally, Canada stresses the fact that this Part 8, one of a number of eBusiness standards focuses on business transaction aspects only as a subset of the full totality of privacy requirements, i.e. that which falls into the domain of "collaboration space" (see Part s4 and 6) . As such, it is important to make this clear in Clause 1.2 and its sub-clauses.</p> <p>Note: Due to resource constraints, Canada was not able to fully integrate all of its ballot comments, as well as providing cross-references</p>			

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				among those which are linked.			
CA02	All		ge/te/ed	<p>Due to resource constraints, Canada was not able to fully integrate all of its ballot comments, as well as providing cross-references among those which are linked.</p> <p>In addition, Canada was not able to provide additional draft text.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. SC32/WG1 members should be encouraged to provide additional contributions to Part 8 standards development work, i.e. until 25 July, 2008. 2. SC32/WG2 should adopt a resolution to this effect including a call for additional contributions. 	Accepted; Project Editors to note document WG 1 N0377 as a contribution. Additional contributions are encouraged.	
CA03	All		ge/te	<p>Canada notes that at the same time that this CD document is open for ballot comments that several other parts of ISO/IEC 15944 are out for ballot or in preparation for draft FDIS for either their 2nd or 3rd edition, i.e. namely,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - draft FDIS for 3rd edition(E/F) for ISO/IEC 14662 - draft FDIS for 2nd edition (E) for ISO/IEC 15944-1 - ballot on CD3 for ISO/IEC 15944-3 -OeDT - FDIS ballot for ISO/IEC 15944-8 –eBusiness Vocabulary <p>It is important to ensure that the results of this standards development work is integrated with the results of the ballot</p>	Request the Project Editors to ensure that the next version of the document prepared for ballot for Part 8 is harmonized with the existing state of the SC32/WG1 standards documents identified.	Accepted: Project Editors to take appropriate action	

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				resolutions and/or SC32/WG1 comments on the above noted documents			
CA03	All	Lines 1-28	te/ed	<p>Canada supports the Project Editor's Notes as follows:</p> <p>1) re Note 4), Canada supports a restructuring/re-ordering of the existing Clauses and sub-Clauses where the Project Editors are of the opinion that this will improve the resulting standard</p> <p>2) notes that it has subsequent comments which need to be taken into account by the Project Editors for any possible restructuring (other P-member bodies may also have comments which are of impact here)</p> <p>3) Canada supports Note 5).</p>	<p>1) Project Editors should be free to restructure existing Clauses and/or sub-clauses in the next ballot document for this standard provided that a rationale is provided by the Project Editors, i.e. in the form of "Project Editors' Notes"</p> <p>2) If Project Editors are of the opinion that this standard will benefit from the addition of one or more informative Annexes, they are encouraged to develop and include the same.</p>	Accepted	
CA04	All	Lines 29-30 & 3339-3371	te/ed	<p>Canada notes the current Table of Contents (as found in lines 29-30 and the need for additional clauses (and sub-clauses), as identified by the Project Editors in Lines 3339-3371.</p> <p>Canada supports the need for these Clauses/sub-clauses to be in Part 8</p>	Project Editors to provide a single integrated Table of Contents for Part 8, integrating this CA04 comment and that on CA03 above, as well as those resulting from resolution of more detailed Canadian ballot comments as presented below.	Accepted	

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
CA05	All		te/ed	<p>ISO/IEC 15944-1 has extensive rules, normative text, footnotes and Annexes which focus on or provide examples of external constraints applicable where the sub-type of Person is an "individual".</p> <p>Further development of this Part 8 will benefit from the mining and use of these elements in 15944-1 and then used them in a privacy protection requirements context and perspective.</p> <p>Such an approach should also facilitate the development work still required to complete this Part 8.</p> <p>Additional Canadian comments below identify particular cases where sub-clauses in Part 8 will benefit from being based on existing work already completed in 15944-1.</p> <p>This comment also applies to the mining and use of the other existing Parts of ISO/IEC 15944, i.e. 2, 4, 5, and 6.</p>	Project Editors are requested to maximize use of ISO/IEC 15944-1 as well as its other Parts where these provide rules, normative text, Annexes, examples, etc. which focus on "individual", and use and apply them in a privacy protection requirements perspective.	Accepted	
CA0	Clause 0.	Lines 111-	ge/e	Canada notes that text in Clauses 0.1.1 -> 0.-7 is taken	Project Editors to apply and	Accepted	

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
6	Introduction	458	d	from and based on and references existing SC32/WG1 standards and standards development work. Canada requests that the next Part 8 ballot document be amended to reflect/incorporate the same. See also comment CA02 above	implement		
CA07	Clause 1.1	Lines 501-546	te	Canada supports the Statement of Scope for Part 8 and request that SC32/WG1 declare it to be "stable" (in order to facilitate the completion of the development work for the completion of this standard)	Recommended adopt but integrate ballot comments from other P-members on Clause 1.1	Accepted	
CA08	Clause 1.1	Line 514	ed	Update to include reference to Parts 6 and 7 of 15944	Apply	Accepted	
CA09	Clause 1.2	Lines 553-567	te	1) Canada requests that at its ballot resolution meeting, SC32/WG1 review the text as well as Project Editors Notes, and as a result declare this Clause to be stable from a technical perspective; and, that, 2) such a decision be incorporate results of comments on Clause 1.3	Apply	Accepted	
CA10	Clause 1.2.2	Lines 570-586	te/ed	This sub-clause will benefit from some possible added clarifying	There are two options here:	Accept Option 2	

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				text by stating that the focus is on "collaboration space" and that thus anything that does not pertain to or is not part of collaboration space and eBusiness modelling techniques is excluded., Specific reference here to Part 4 and Part 6 would be useful	1) amend and add text to Clause 1.2.2 accordingly; or, 2) Add a new sub-clause 1.2. n "Aspects outside "collaboration space" and not required for eBusiness modelling. SC32/WG1 to discuss and decide at its Sydney ballot resolution meeting.		
CA1 1	Clause 1.3	Lines 642- 675	te	Canada recognise that 1) there are many aspects pertaining to supporting privacy protection requirements from a business operational view(BOV) perspective; and, 2) that it will not be possible, nor should the 1 st edition of this Part 8 attempt to address them all (all at once) . It is important that this Clause 1.3 be made stable as soon as possible so that the Project Editors in order for the Project Editors to be able to complete development work on this 1 st edition. {See also CA12 below}	SC32/WG1 to discuss and decide at the Sydney ballot resolution meeting.	Covered by CA01	

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
CA1 2	Clause 1.3	Lines 649-651	te	<p>Canada notes that this CD document makes provision for an Annex F pertaining to the interworking among privacy protection and consumer protection requirements and that also work on this matter has already been completed but not yet integrated in the CD document. In addition, the CD document contains a Clause 6.2.1 "Person and external constraints: Consumer protection".</p> <p>As such one should make a distinction between the preparation of a detailed approach versus that of focussing on the first level, i.e. more primitive aspects only.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) change current text in line 649 from "the interworking between" to "the detailed interworking among" 2) line 651, delete the text referencing Annex F and replace by text such as "Here Clause n.n.n below focuses on the most elementary, i.e. primitive, aspects only"; and, 3) insert a new Clause n.n.n, possibly as 6.3..2 Key Requirements common to privacy protection and consumer protection requirements" 	<p>Accepted</p> <p>Accepted</p> <p>Accepted</p>	
CA1 3	Clause 1.3	Line 652	te	<p>With respect to comment CA12, a similar situation applies to the need to address, at the primitive level, to the interworking of a nature which at least brings forward the more primitive elements of the interworking among individual accessibility and privacy protection requirements. Here document SC32/WG1 N0376 titled "UN</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) insert a "bullet" with text re interworking among privacy protection and individual accessibility requirements, similar in nature to that re privacy protection; 2) add a new Clause 6.3.3 "Key requirements common to privacy 	<p>Accepted; See also Sydney Resolution WG1 / 17</p>	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				<p>Convention on Rights of Persons with Disabilities” serves as a base document for the identification of accessibility requirements.</p> <p>\This UN Convention has an article 22 “Respect for Privacy” as well as stating informed consent, decision taking and commitment making requirement with respect to the semantics of the provision of recorded information (e.g. as human interface equivalents(HIEs).</p>	<p>protection and individual accessibility requirements”</p> <p>3) reference and use this UN Convention as the basis for the identification of such requirements, at the primitive level; and,</p> <p>4) add Clause 6.3.1 Introduction to Clauses 6.3.2 and 6.3.3 with Clause 6.3 titled as “Key requirements common to privacy protection, consumer protection and individual accessibility requirements</p> <p>Also make and use this UN Convention as a Referenced Specification in Clause 2.2 (and, if deemed appropriate, add a short informative Annex pertaining to the same)</p>		
CA14	Clause 1.3	Lines 653-656	te/ed	In ISO/IEC 15944-1, Annex C, and especially Annex D (including D.5 titled “Some common policy and implementation considerations for unambiguous identification of Persons as individuals) already contain extensive text which should be mined for use in Part 8. In addition , Clause 6.1.4 titled	Canada request Project Editors to	Accepted	
					<p>1) add a new clause n (and associated sub-clauses) with as tentative title “Identification, registration and Management of identities of an Individual;</p> <p>2) base this work on rules, normative text, figures,</p>	Accepted	

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				<p>"Business transaction: unambiguous identification of entities", Clause 6.2.2 titled "Person, persona, identification and Person signature" and Clause 6.2.3 titled "Person – identity and authentication" provide a significant number of rules, related normative text and figures, which should be mined and used for the development of a Clause, sub-clauses similar in nature as they apply to the identification and registration of schemas involving the control and management of LRLs of individuals and "recognized individual identity (rid)".</p> <p>Further, ISO/IEC 15944-5 deals with the concept of legally recognized name, business transaction identifier (BTI), and other concept and rules which are relevant to this issue</p>	<p>Annexes, etc. as already found in Parts 1 and Part 5 of 15944 re "Persons" and apply it the same, as appropriate, to "individuals";</p> <p>3) consider viewing an identification schema for the registration of individuals as a special type of coded domain and one which thus can be referenced as a semantic component for use as part of an information bundle in a scenario; and,</p> <p>4) identify which of the above are to be included at the "primitive" level in this 1st edition for Part 8 and which are to be considered as "Aspects not yet addressed"</p>	<p>Project Editors to consider</p> <p>See CA01 above</p>	
CA15	Clause 1.3	Lines 658-660	te/ed	Apply the approach recommend in CA 12 and CA14 also to the issues identified in lines 658-660	Apply approach agreed to for resolution of ballot comment CA12 and CA14	Accepted	
CA14	Clause 1.3	Line 666	ed	Insert "privacy" before the two occurrences of "protection"	Apply	Accepted	
CA15	2	Lines 122-128	te/ed	Canada supports the Project Editors Notes and request them to implement the same prior to	Apply	Accepted	

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				the issuance of the FCD document for this standard			
CA16	2.2	Lines 854-860	te/ed	Canada requests that the Project Editors include as "Referenced Specifications" the "OECD Guidelines on the Protection of Privacy and Transborder Data Flows of Personal Data" and the "95/46/EC Directive on Data Protection passed by the Council and Parliament of Europe"	Project Editors required to complete required to complete the required forms here as per JTC1 Directives.	Accepted	
CA17	3	Lines 905-2740	ed	<p>Canada notes that all the definitions/terms in Clause 3 are taken from existing ISO standards. Canada requests the Project Editors to implement their Project Editors notes if not for the CD2 then for the FCD ballot document.</p> <p>Canada notes that re ISO/IEC 14662 a 3rd edition and a 2nd edition of ISO/IEC 15944-1 are in preparation and ISO/IEC 15944-7 is currently undergoing FDIS ballot. Based on the result of this standards development work , Canada requests where this Part 8 references in Clause 3 any one of these standards, the Project Editors are requested to</p>	<p>Apply</p> <p>Apply</p>	<p>Accepted</p> <p>-</p>	

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				amend the definitions/terms referenced accordingly in the revised Clause 3 for this standard			
CA18	3	Lines 905-2740	te/ed	Canada requests the Project Editors (and P-members) to identify any other additional concepts if required, and to do so prior to the issuance of the FCD ballot document for this standard	SC32/WG1 to discuss and decide at the Sydney ballot resolution meeting.		Accepted; WG 1 members to submit contributions for additional concepts and their definition by 31 Aug 2008
CA19	3	Lines 921-931	te/ed	Given the SC32/WG1 document, Canada request the Project Editors to reconsider the anticipated deletion of concepts/definitions identified here. They may well be necessary to support "individual accessibility" requirements.	Project Editors request to reconsider.		Accepted; see CA13 above
CA20	4	Line 2472-2750	ed	Canada supports the Project Editors Notes and request them to implement the same prior to the issuance of the FCD document for this standard	Apply		Accepted
CA21	5.1	Line 2754-2775	ed	Canada supports the Project Editors Notes and request them to implement the same prior to the issuance of the FCD document for this standard	Apply		Accepted
CA22	5.2	Lines 2776-2793	te/ed	Canada notes that a primary source for these fundamental principles should be based on	Apply		Accepted

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				<p>those already stated in the ISO/IEC 14662 and Parts 1, 2, 4, 5, 6 and 7 of ISO/IEC 15944. Canada. Canada requests the Project Editors to prepare text For Clause 5.2 based on these existing Open-edi and eBusiness standards.</p> <p>Canada also notes that some of the primary sources of external constraints here are already identified in ISO/IEC 15944-1 & -5 and in their Referenced Specifications as well as those identified in Clause 2.2 above. Canada requests the Project Editors to also mine these sources to complete text for Clause 5.2.</p> <p>Finally, Canada notes Annex D (Normative) Integrated set of information life cycle management (ILCM) principles in support of information law compliance. Canada requests the Project Editors to consider integrating the text of Annex D into Clause 5.2 Principles and associated rules. One reason here is that privacy requirements can be considered a sub-type of information law requirements.</p>	<p>Apply</p> <p>Project Editors requested to consider</p>		-

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
CA23	5.3	Line 2794-2975	te/ed	<p>Canada supports the Project Editors' Notes as well as the 12 Privacy Protection Principles identified. Unless there are other P-member comments here, Canada considers these 12 Principles to be considered "stable" and form the basis for Clauses 5.4+.</p> <p>Canada also requests that the "Notes" (see lines 2948-2974) be either converted into appropriate text in Clause 5.3 and/or serve as the basis for added text in Clauses 5.4+.</p> <p>Canada notes that the rules in Clause 5.3 will benefit from being followed by text of an explanatory nature of benefit to users, i.e. 1-3 sentences</p>	Project Editors are requested to implement this comment.		Accepted
CA24	5.4	Line 2975 - 3077	te/ed	<p>Canada finds the concept of "collaboration space" to be very important and germane to the completion and use of Part 8.</p> <p>Here Part 4 and 6 (and to some degree Part 5) of ISO/IEC 15944 contain useful rules, text, figures, examples which should be mined and used in a strengthened and expanded Clause 5.4 and its sub-clauses.</p>	Project Editors are requested to expand and strengthen Clause 5.4 based on existing ISO/IEC 15944 standards and make a stronger, more direct link between "collaboration space" and privacy protection, i.e. where the individual is the buyer in a business transaction with the "collaboration space" being that of the interworking, information flows, information life cycle management		Accepted

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				See also above comment CA10	(ILCM) requirement, etc. between the individual and the seller (and or regulator) as applicable.		
CA2 5	6	Lines 3080 - 3308	te/ed	Canada considers this Clause and its sub-clause to be basically "stable". However, the order of the sub-clause should be changed to provide pre-eminence to "privacy protection" as follows: -6.2.1 privacy protection - 6.3.2 consumer protection - 6.2.3 individual accessibility - 6.2.4 human rights	Apply		Accepted; Project Editors requested to implement
CA2 6	6.3	Line 3309	te	Canada requests the addition of a new Clause 6.3 and associated sub-clauses bases on the rationale provided in the above comments CA12 and CA13	Apply using comments CA12 and CA13		Accepted
CA2 7	7	Lines 3310 - 3371	te/ed	Canada supports the proposed table of contents for the Sub-Clauses of Clause 7. Canadian comments above, CA05, CA14, CA22 already identify existing SC32/WG1 standards work, i.e. the existing Parts of ISO/IEC 15944 which	Project Editors are requested to take this approach in the drafting of rule, text and examples, as well as appropriate figures for the completion of Clause 7 in Part 8 Taking into account the resolution of other P-member ballot		Accepted; Project Editors requested to implement

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				<p>are relevant here</p> <p>Canada requests the Project Editors to prepare a completed draft of Clause and its sub-clauses based on existing clauses, sub-clauses, rules, text, figures, etc. of a general nature, i.e. as focused on "Person" in 15944-1 as well as external constraints identified in Part 5, and use and apply these as applicable to an "individual"</p> <p>For example Clause 7.2.3 would integrate elements in Part 1, Clause 6.2.2 with Part 5 work on LRLs.</p> <p>Clause 7.2.4 would be built on Clause 7.2.3 and add truncation concepts and rules from Part 5</p> <p>Clause 7.2.5 would benefit from use of Part 1, Clause 6.2.3 and Annexes C and D</p> <p>Clause 7.2.6 should be based on Part 1, Annex D.5.2 "Anonymity"</p> <p>Clause 7.2.7 would integrate aspects of Part 1, Clause 6.2.5 re agents and third party</p> <p>Clause 7.3 would take Part 1</p>	<p>comments on this CD document, Canada requests that SC32/WG1 instruct the Project Editors to prepare a draft Clause 8 no later than 31 August, 2008 and circulate this draft to SC32/WG1 members for comment to be received no later than 25 September for incorporating into the preparation of a draft FCD ballot document to be reviewed by SC32/WG1 at its interim December, 2008/January, 2008 meeting.</p>		

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				<p>Rules Governing the process component"</p> <p>Clause 7.4 would take Part 1, Clauses 6.4 Rules Governing the Data Component" (and its sub-clauses) and apply them in a privacy protection requirements context.</p> <p>In addition , one should also use the following elements from ISO/IEC 15944-5</p> <p>Re Clause 7.4.2 use Part 5 , Clause 6.6.4.4 work on business transaction identifier</p> <p>Re: Clause 7.4.3 use Part 5 Clause 6.6.4.2"State Changes"</p> <p>Re Clause 7.4.4 use Part 5 Clause 6.6.4.2 " Record retention"</p> <p>Re: Clause 7.4.5 use Part 5, Clause 6.6.4.5 work on "Date/time referencing".</p> <p>etc.</p>			
CA2 8	1Clause 8	-Lines 3374-3409	te/ed	Canada has already made several comments above whose resolution also impacts this Clause 8. These include CA05, CA10, CA12, (CA13), CA14,	Project Editors are requested to take this approach in the drafting of rule, text and examples, as well as appropriate figures for the		Accepted; Project Editors to implement

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				<p>CA23, CA25, and CA 27.</p> <p>On the whole Canada is of the opinion, that the best approach to completing Clause 8 is also one of mining existing parts of the multipart ISO/IEC 15944 eBusiness standard, i.e. rules, concepts/definitions, normative text, figures, examples, Annexes, etc. and apply them to the specific focus on an "individual", as one of the three sub-types of "Person" as well as integrating privacy protection requirements, including the application of the Clause 5 Fundamental Principles.</p> <p>Taking into account the resolution of other P-member ballot comments on this CD document</p>	<p>completion of Clause 8 in Part 8</p> <p>Taking into account the resolution of other P-member ballot comments on this CD document, Canada requests that SC32/WG1 instruct the Project Editors to prepare a draft Clause 8 no later than 31 August, 2008 and circulate this draft to SC32/WG1 members for comment to be received no later than 25 September for incorporating into the preparation of a draft FCD ballot document to be reviewed by SC32/WG1 at its interim December, 2008/January, 2008 meeting.</p>		
CA29	Clause 8(+7)	-	te/ed	<p>Canada notes that proposed Clause for Clause 7, i.e. Clauses 7.2.3, 7.2.4, 7.2.5 and 7.2.6 are of a nature which would more appropriately see them as being part of Clause 8.</p> <p>In addition, given the fact that in the development of ISO/IEC 15944-1, one of the primary issues was that pertaining to</p>	<p>SC32/WG1 to discuss and decide upon at its Sydney ballot resolution meeting.</p>		Accepted; see CA14

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
				identification (of Persons) and the subsequent development of its Annexes C & D in support of the same , Canada recommends that the order of the presentation of Clauses 7 and 8 be reversed, i.e. make Clause 8 -> Clause 7 and vice-versa in the next version of the Part 8 document			
CA30	Clause 9	Lines 3411 - 3514	ed/te	This Clause 9 needs to be updated by the Project Editors as development work on all the previous Clauses is completed	Project Editors are requested to update Clause 9 for the FCD ballot document version based on completion of work on the previous Clauses.		Accepted
CA31	Annex A	Lines 3517 -3560	ed/te	Canada supports the Project Editors Notes and requests them to implement them not later than at the FCD ballot document stage	Request Project Editors to implement		Accepted
CA32	Annex B	Lines 3561 -3627	ed/te	Canada supports the Project Editors Notes and requests them to implement them not later than at the FCD ballot document stage	Request Project Editors to implement		Accepted
CA33	Annex C	Lines 3628 - 3862	te/ed	Canada considers this Annex to be stable	Amendments, changes or addition of text should be of an editing nature only. Footnotes may be added to provide examples		Accepted
CA3	Annex D	Lines 3864	te/ed	Canada considers this Annex to	Amendments, changes or addition of text should be of an editing		Accepted

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph / Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
4		– 4024		be stable	nature only. Footnotes may be added to provide examples		
CA3 5	Annex D	Lines 4199-4226	te/ed	Canada supports the inclusion of this Annex JF (see also comment CA 12 above)	Canada commits itself to provide draft text for completion of Annex F.		Accepted
CA3 6	Bibliography	Lines 4227-4251	ed	Canada requests the Project Editors to complete the Bibliography. However, Canada requests that any entry in the Bibliography <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1) be actually used and referenced in Part; and, 2) have a proper “bibliographic citation” independent of any added information with respect to its being available via a URL 	Request Project Editors to implement and apply		Accepted

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
#	NB	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note #	Comment type	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
01	US			te	US votes "Disapprove, With Comments" for this CD. USA appreciates the work completed by the Project Editors in expediting the drafting of this CD Extensive work remains on the definition of some the concepts and ideas, especially in completing clauses/subclauses identified by Project Editors notes and in their harmonization to the other Parts of ISO/IEC 15944.	USA requests that the resolution of comments on this second CD document be undertaken in a harmonized manner with the resolution of comments for other parts of ISO/IEC 15944.	So noted	Accepted
02	US	Foreword	Line 96	ed	Include Part 8: Identification of privacy requirements as external constraints on business			Accepted
03	US	0.1	Line 119	ed	Change Annex E to Annex C			Accepted
04	US	0.1.2	Line 217	ed	Delete the comma after "distinguish"			Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	(8)
#	NB	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note #	Comment type	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Joint project editors' comments
05	US	0.2	Line 250-257	te	Properly align these lines			Accepted
06	US	0.2	Line 259	ed	Add "in the first edition of" after "in"			Accepted
07	US	0.2	Line 272	ed	Delete the comma after "Person"			Accepted
08	US	0.2	Line 274	ed	Delete " after "it"			Accepted
09	US	1.1	Line 537	ed	put Formal Description Technique into bold font as well as the first occurrence of every defined term in the document			Accepted
10	US	1.2.2	Line 573	ed	Delete the comma after "Model"			Accepted
11	US	1.2.3	Line 594	ed	Change "or" to "of"			Accepted
12	US	1.2.4	Line 618	ed	Change "transaction" to "transactions"			Accepted
13	US	5.4.2	Line 3003	ed	Change "images" to "image"			Accepted
14	US	5.4.3	Line 3044	ed	Delete "the introduction of"			Accepted
15	US	5.4.3	Line 3068	ed	Change "an gent" to "agent"			Accepted
16	US	Clause 7	Line 3329	ed	Change "require" to "required"			Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.