

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N 1749

Date: 2008-05-25

REPLACES: _____

<p>ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32</p> <p>Data Management and Interchange</p> <p>Secretariat: United States of America (ANSI) Administered by Farance Inc. on behalf of ANSI</p>
--

DOCUMENT TYPE	Disposition of Comments
TITLE	Disposition of comments on CD 19773 Information technology - Metadata registries (MDR) modules
SOURCE	WG2 - Frank Farance - Project Editor
PROJECT NUMBER	1.32.23.01.00.00
STATUS	Disposition of comments in 32N1590 (comments on CD 19773 ballot 32N1549). This accompanies FCD 19773 sent to NBs for 3 month letter ballot
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	FYI
REQUESTED ACTION	
DUE DATE	
Number of Pages	20
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members SC Chair WG Conveners and Secretaries

Dr. Timothy Schoechle, Secretary, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Farance Inc *, 3066 Sixth Street, Boulder, CO, United States of America
Telephone: +1 303-443-5490; E-mail: Timothy@Schoechle.org
available from the JTC 1/SC 32 WebSite <http://www.jtc1sc32.org/>
*Farance Inc. administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

Approved Canadian Comments on SC32 N1549 CD 19773-1

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-04-23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 01	Introduction	Para. 1	ed	The introduction refers to 'The International Standard' as if it were the only one.	Change 'The' to 'This'.	Will make change.
CA 02	General		ed	The Editor's note preceding clause 1, and the page headers throughout the document refer to 'Release Sequence #6'. This is a convention that was used when the standard had multiple parts. Now that the standard has been consolidated into a single part, it serves no purpose.	Remove all references to Release Sequence #.	Will make change.
CA 85	<i>Table of Contents</i>	All	ed	Other comments call for the deletion of placeholder clauses.	Refresh the table of contents once clause have been removed and renumbered.	Some placeholder clauses cannot be deleted, such as 3.2-3.9..
CA 03	3	Para. 2	ed	The paragraph is incomplete.	Delete the paragraph 'Terms within'.	Will make change.
CA 86	3	All	ed	References to terms taken from other standards do not have clause numbers.	Add clause numbers to referenced standards.	This is not required according to ISO style guide.
CA 87	3	All	ed	The organization of clause 3 into multiple sun-clause by modules makes it hard to find terms alphabetically.	Add an Annex that lists all terms alphabetically, as was done in 11179.	Will add a list in preparation for FDIS text.
CA 04	3.1	clause title	ed	The current title does not clearly reflect the content of the clause, since the context in which the terminology might be considered 'Common' is not specified.	Change the sub-title to: "Terminology applicable to more than one module"	Will make change.
CA 05	3.1	all	ed	Terms should be ordered alphabetically within each subclause to make them easy to locate.	Order the terms alphabetically. E.g. the following are out of sequence: 3.1.12, 3.1.15, 3.1.16, 3.1.17, 3.1.21, 3.1.22	Disagree with proposed change because an alphabetical ordering would not be preserved in language translations. The current ordering is a thematic ordering.
CA 88	3.1.2	definition	te	The definition is unclear, and not good grammar. "to access the object to which a referent references [ISO/IEC 20944-1]" According to 3.1.10, referent is the result of referencing. (I.e. the target for a reference.	Suggested clarification: to access the object which references a referent [ISO/IEC 20944-1]	Will make change.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-04-23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 06	3.1.6	definition	te	The definition of 'metadata module' is given as 'unit of descriptive data', which begs the question 'what is meant by unit'? The term 'unit' may imply some level of 'indivisibility' It is possible a module could contain groupings of data.	Change the definition to: 'unit or grouping of descriptive data which is created, managed, used and/or interchanged among autonomous parties as a single discrete set in a specified context'.	Will make change.
CA 07	3.1.14	all	ed	This term is a duplicate of 3.1.2	Delete 3.1.14	Will make change.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-04-23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 08	3.1.20	definition & note	te	The definition of 'smallest permitted maximum' is unclear.	<p>Change the definition</p> <p>From:</p> <p>"meet-or-exceed provision for a required minimum value that specifies an implementation value describing the maximum value of a sizing parameter"</p> <p>To:</p> <p>" meet-or-exceed provision that specifies a required minimum value for an implementation-defined value describing the maximum value of a sizing parameter"</p> <p>Also change the Note:</p> <p>From:</p> <p>" An SPM sets a lower bound for implementations."</p> <p>To:</p> <p>" An SPM sets a lower bound for an implementation-defined maximum value."</p> <p>Also add the concept/definition for "permitted maximum value"</p>	<p><i>Will make change, except for adding the addition definition for "permitted maximum value" because this additional definition is unnecessary, i.e., the notion of permitted maximum value is not normally used this way.</i></p>
CA 09	3.16.5.9	definition	ed	The definition refers to 'given name' instead of 'postcode'	change 'given name' to 'postcode'.	<p><i>Will make change.</i></p>
CA 10	3.16.5.10	definition	ed	The definition refers to 'given name' instead of 'postcode'	change 'given name' to 'postcode'.	<p><i>Will make change.</i></p>

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007 –04 –23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 11	3.16.5.11	definition	ed	The definition refers to 'given name' instead of 'postcode'	change 'given name' to 'postcode'.	Will make change.
CA 12	3.17.1	note	te	The note is not applicable to either the term or the definition	Remove the note.	Will make change.
CA 13	3.20.1	definition	te	The definition of the term 'authentication' is incorrect.	Replace the definition by: " act of verifying the claimed identity of an entity."	Will make change.
CA 14	3.20	definition	te	The term 'authentication' is defined because it is listed as an example of a security mechanism, along with access control, which is not defined. We should be consistent in defining such terms.	Either remove the definition of authentication, or add a definition for 'Access Control', also taken from 2382-08" " means of ensuring that the <i>resources</i> of a <i>data processing system</i> can be accessed only by authorized <i>entities</i> in authorized ways."	Will make change.
CA 15	3.22 thru 3.30	all	ed	These sub-clauses are placeholders which serve no purpose.	Delete 3.22 through 3.30.	Will make change.
CA 89	5	All	te	It should not be mandatory to conform to 20944 in order to claim conform to modules of 19773. Therefore the bindings clause needs to be rephrased to make conformance to 20944 optional. Also, it is not clear how 20944 would apply to each module	Rewrite the bindings clause to explain how 20944 may be used in conjunction with 19773, but not to require it.	Will make change.
CA 90	6	All	te	The conformance clause is inadequate. It should be possible to claim conformance to individual modules, except where conformance to one necessarily requires conformance to another on which it is dependent.	The conformance clause should state that conformance may be claimed to individual modules, show how to do this, and list any dependencies. The reference to 20944 conformance should apply only if conformance to 20944 bindings also being claimed, and this should be optional.	Will make change.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-04-23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 16	7.2	Para. 1	te	Sub-clause 7.2 states that 'profile designation is defined in subclause 8.2', but there is no such subclause, and there is no other occurrence of the term 'profile designation' in the document.	Supply the missing definition/specification of profile designation.	Will make change.
CA 17	10.1	Line 2	ed	'value store' should be 'value stored'	change 'store' to 'stored'	Will make change.
CA 18	10.4.3	Para 2	te	The description of 'reference_kind' states that the structure and format 'or' this component is outside the Scope of this clause. For interoperability purposes, this standard needs to specify a the structure and format of this component.	Specify an extensible structure and format for this component. (Editorial: change 'or' to 'of')	Will make change.XXX
CA 19	10.4.3	Para 3	te	The description of 'reference_encoding' states that the structure and format 'or' this component is outside the Scope of this clause. For interoperability purposes, this standard needs to specify a the structure and format of this component.	Specify an extensible structure and format for this component. (Editorial: change 'or' to 'of')	Will make change.
CA 20	10.4.3	Para 4	te	The description of 'reference_scope' states that the structure and format 'or' this component is outside the Scope of this clause. For interoperability purposes, this standard needs to specify a the structure and format of this component.	Specify an extensible structure and format for this component. (Editorial: change 'or' to 'of')	Will make change.
CA 21	10.4.4	Para 2	te	The description of 'literal_kind' states that the structure and format 'or' this component is outside the Scope of this clause. For interoperability purposes, this standard needs to specify a the structure and format of this component.	Specify an extensible structure and format for this component. (Editorial: change 'or' to 'of')	Will make change.
CA 22	10.4.4	Para 3	te	The description of 'literal_encoding' states that the structure and format 'or' this component is outside the Scope of this clause. For interoperability purposes, this standard needs to specify a the structure and format of this component.	Specify an extensible structure and format for this component. (Editorial: change 'or' to 'of')	Will make change.
CA 23	10.4.4	Para 4	te	The description of 'literal_shape' states that the structure and format 'or' this component is outside the Scope of this clause. For interoperability purposes, this standard needs to specify a the structure and format of this component.	Specify an extensible structure and format for this component. (Editorial: change 'or' to 'of')	Will make change.
CA 24	10.8	All	te	The Examples are 'to be supplied'.	Supply the examples.	Removed examples clauses, examples will be presented in a separate document.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007 –04 –23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 25	11.4.2.1	Figure	ed	The figure overlays the footnote.	The figure should be included 'inline with text' and kept together with its caption.	Will make change.
CA 26	11.4.3.1	Figure	ed	The figure precedes the text that refers to it as 'following'.	The figure should be included 'inline with text' and kept together with its caption. The caption number should be incremented from the previous figure.	Will make change.
CA 27	11.4.3.3	Footnote 14	ed	In footnote 14, 'refit' should be 'reflit'.	Change 'refit' to 'reflit'	Will make change.
CA 28	11.8	All	te	The Examples are 'to be supplied'.	Supply the examples.	Will make change.
CA 29	12.4.1	Footnote 17	ed	The footnote has not been reworded to reflect the consolidation of multiple parts into one part.	Two references to 'Part' should be changed to 'Clause'. Reference to 'Clause 5' should be changed to 'subclause 12.4'. Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 12.5'.	Will make change.
CA 30	12.4.1	Line 2	ed	The reference to clause 6 is left over from the previous multipart organization.	Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 12.5'.	Will make change.
CA 31	12.4.2.1	Figure	ed	The caption associated with the figure duplicates previous figure numbers.	Increment the caption number from the previous figure.	Will make change.
CA 32	12.4.2.3	context designation	te	The specification of context designation is not rigorous enough. Interoperability requires a standard way of specifying at least some types of context, while extensibility is also necessary for unanticipated uses.	Provide both a standard way of specifying certain predefined contexts, such as language, geography and more. Provide a standard way for implementers and users to specify additional contexts.	The specification of standard context profiles is outside the scope of the standard.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-04-23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 33	12.4.2.3	value encoding	te	The specification of value encoding is not rigorous enough. Interoperability requires a standard way of specifying at least some types of value encoding, while extensibility is also necessary for unanticipated uses.	Provide both a standard way of specifying certain predefined value encodings, such as provided in footnote 18. Provide a standard way for implementers and users to specify additional value encodings.	Provided additional description for interoperability..
CA 34	12.4.3.1	Figure	ed	The figure overlays the footnote.	The figure should be included 'inline with text' and kept together with its caption.	Will make change.
CA 35	12.4.3.3	Footnote 19	ed	In footnote 19, 'refit' should be 'reflit', and the references to Clause 12 should be to Clause 10.	Change 'refit' to 'reflit'. Change two references to Clause 12 to Clause 10.	Will make change.
CA 36	12.8	All	te	The Examples are 'to be supplied'.	Supply the examples.	Will make change.
CA 37	13.4.1	Footnote 20	ed	The footnote has not been reworded to reflect the consolidation of multiple parts into one part.	Two references to 'Part' should be changed to 'Clause'. Reference to 'Clause 5' should be changed to 'subclause 13.4'. Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 13.5'.	Will make change.
CA 38	13.4.1	Para 1 line 4	ed	The reference to clause 6 is left over from the previous multipart organization.	Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 13.5'.	Will make change.
CA 39	13.4.3	Figure	ed	The caption associated with the figure duplicates previous figure numbers.	Increment the caption number from the previous figure.	Will make change.
CA 40	13.8	All	te	The Examples are 'to be supplied'.	Supply the examples.	Will make change.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007 –04 –23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 41	14.4.1	Footnote 23	ed	The footnote has not been reworded to reflect the consolidation of multiple parts into one part.	Two references to 'Part' should be changed to 'Clause'. Reference to 'Clause 5' should be changed to 'subclause 14.4'. Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 14.5'.	Will make change.
CA 42	14.4.1	Para 1 line 5	ed	The reference to clause 6 is left over from the previous multipart organization.	Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 14.5'.	Will make change.
CA 43	14.4.2	Figure	ed	The caption associated with the figure duplicates previous figure numbers.	Increment the caption number from the previous figure.	Will make change.
CA 44	14.8	All	te	The Examples are 'to be supplied'.	Supply the examples.	Will make change.
CA 45	15	All	ed	What is Clause 15 reserved for?	Supply the missing clause, or remove it and renumber subsequent clauses (and remove 3.15 and renumber subsequent sub-clauses).	Will make change.
CA 46	16.4.1	Footnote 24	ed	The footnote has not been reworded to reflect the consolidation of multiple parts into one part.	Two references to 'Part' should be changed to 'Clause'. Reference to 'Clause 5' should be changed to 'subclause 16.4'. Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 16.5'.	Will make change.
CA 47	16.4.1	Para 1 line 2	ed	The reference to clause 6 is left over from the previous multipart organization.	Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 16.5'.	Will make change.
CA 48	16.4.2.1	Figure	ed	The figure overlays its caption..	The figure should be included 'inline with text' and kept together with its caption.	Will make change.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007 –04 –23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 49	16.4.3.1	Figures	ed	The first figure overlays its accompanying text, and follows its caption. The caption numbers for both figures need renumbering.	The figure should be included 'inline with text' and kept together with its caption. Increment the caption number from the previous figure.	Will make change.
CA 50	16.4.3.2	Figures	ed	The first figure has no caption. The caption on the second figure needs renumbering.	Provide an appropriate caption for the first figure, and renumber the caption for the second figure.	Will make change.
CA 51	16.4.3.3.2	Table	ed	The table needs numbering.	Number the table.	Will make change.
CA 52	16.4.3.3.3	Table	ed	The table needs numbering.	Number the table.	Will make change.
CA 53	16.4.3.3.4	Table	ed	The table needs numbering.	Number the table.	Will make change.
CA 54	16.8	All	te	The Examples are 'to be supplied'.	Supply the examples.	Will make change.
CA 55	17.4.1	Footnote 30	ed	The footnote has not been reworded to reflect the consolidation of multiple parts into one part.	Two references to 'Part' should be changed to 'Clause'. Reference to 'Clause 5' should be changed to 'subclause 17.4'. Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 17.5'.	Will make change.
CA 56	17.4.1	Para 1 line 2	ed	The reference to clause 6 is left over from the previous multipart organization.	Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 17.5'.	Will make change.
CA 57	17.4.1	Figure	ed	The caption associated with the figure duplicates previous figure numbers.	Increment the caption number from the previous figure.	Will make change.
CA 58	17.5.2	Line 5	ed	"mutlivalue" should be "multivalue".	Change "mutlivalue" to "multivalue".	Will make change.
CA 59	17.8	All	te	The Examples are 'to be supplied'.	Supply the examples.	Will make change.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007 –04 –23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 60	18.4.1	Footnote 35	ed	The footnote has not been reworded to reflect the consolidation of multiple parts into one part.	Two references to 'Part' should be changed to 'Clause'. Reference to 'Clause 5' should be changed to 'subclause 18.4'. Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 18.5'.	Will make change.
CA 61	18.4.1	Para 1 line 2	ed	The reference to clause 6 is left over from the previous multipart organization.	Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 18.5'.	Will make change.
CA 62	18.4.1	Figure	ed	The caption associated with the figure duplicates previous figure numbers.	Increment the caption number from the previous figure.	Will make change.
CA 63	18.8	All	te	The Examples are 'to be supplied'.	Supply the examples.	Will make change.
CA 64	19.4.1	Footnote 43	ed	The footnote has not been reworded to reflect the consolidation of multiple parts into one part.	Two references to 'Part' should be changed to 'Clause'. Reference to 'Clause 5' should be changed to 'subclause 19.4'. Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 19.5'.	Will make change.
CA 65	19.4.1	Para 1 line 2	ed	The reference to clause 6 is left over from the previous multipart organization.	Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 19.5'.	Will make change.
CA 66	19.4.1	Figure	ed	The caption associated with the figure duplicates previous figure numbers.	Increment the caption number from the previous figure.	Will make change.
CA 67	19.5.2	Description	te	The reference to the description is incorrect.	The reference should be to 19.4.2	Will make change.
CA 68	19.5.3	Description	te	The reference to the description is incorrect.	The reference should be to 19.4.3	Will make change.
CA 69	19.8	All	te	The Examples are 'to be supplied'.	Supply the examples.	Will make change.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007 –04 –23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 70	20.4.1	Footnote 49	ed	The footnote has not been reworded to reflect the consolidation of multiple parts into one part.	Two references to 'Part' should be changed to 'Clause'. Reference to 'Clause 5' should be changed to 'subclause 20.4'. Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 20.5'.	Will make change.
CA 71	20.4.1	Para 1 line 2	ed	The reference to clause 6 is left over from the previous multipart organization.	Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 20.5'.	Will make change.
CA 72	20.4.1	Figure	ed	The caption associated with the figure duplicates previous figure numbers.	Increment the caption number from the previous figure.	Will make change.
CA 73	20.5.2	Description	te	The reference to the description is incorrect.	The reference should be to 20.4.2	Will make change.
CA 74	20.5.3	Description	te	The reference to the description is incorrect.	The reference should be to 20.4.3	Will make change.
CA 75	20.5.4	Description	te	The reference to the description is incorrect.	The reference should be to 20.4.4	Will make change.
CA 76	20.8	All	te	The Examples are 'to be supplied'.	Supply the examples.	Will make change.
CA 77	21.4.1	Footnote 51	ed	The footnote has not been reworded to reflect the consolidation of multiple parts into one part.	Two references to 'Part' should be changed to 'Clause'. Reference to 'Clause 5' should be changed to 'subclause 21.4'. Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 21.5'.	Will make change.
CA 78	21.4.1	Para 1 line 2	ed	The reference to clause 6 is left over from the previous multipart organization.	Reference to 'Clause 6' should be changed to 'subclause 21.5'.	Will make change.
CA 79	21.4.1	Figure	ed	The caption associated with the figure duplicates previous figure numbers.	Increment the caption number from the previous figure.	Will make change.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-04-23

Document: ISO/IEC CD 19773-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 80	21.5.2	Description	te	The reference to the description is incorrect.	The reference should be to 21.4.2	Will make change.
CA 81	21.5.3	Description	te	The reference to the description is incorrect.	The reference should be to 21.4.3	Will make change.
CA 82	21.8	All	te	The Examples are 'to be supplied'.	Supply the examples.	Will make change.
CA 83	22 thru 30	All	ed	Reserving clauses 22 through 30 for future use serves no purpose. They can be added when required.	Delete clauses 22 through 30	Will make change.
CA 84	Front matter	N/a	ed	The document contains multiple Figures and Tables but there is no easy way to locate them.	Add a Table of Figures and a Table of Tables.	Will let ISO editor make this change in FDIS text.

ISO

International Organization for Standardization



**ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Data Management and Interchange
WG 2
Metadata**

Title: Japan Ballot Comments on ISO/IEC CD 19773

Status: Document to accompany ballot response

Author: Hajime Horiuchi

References:

[1] 32N1549, ISO/IEC CD 19773, Information technology —Metadata Registries (MDR) modules

SEQ #	Cmnt ID	See Also	Severity	Reference	Description	Addressed By
001	JPN-P01-001		2-Major Technical	<i>Introduction, General</i>	<p>In the introduction, there is a description that the International Standard specifies small modules of data to be used or reused in applications, such as the UPU postal code or the ITU-T E.164 phone number data. However, regarding other modules, it is necessary to be harmonized with SDOs that standardize such each data element.</p> <p>On the other hand, if it is limited to metadata on 11179, each subject should be defined within the scope of existing edition. Otherwise, it could be difficult to address a data element for future version of 11179 series. These points are unclear and should make them clear.</p> <p>If the registration of objects for MDR is intended, the Metamodel Registry (MFI) of ISO/IEC 19763 could be applicable. It should be addressed in the document.</p>	At BRM, JP NB asked for a "concept system" module that could be reused by 19763 and 11179.

End of Paper

2	(3)	4	5		(6)	(7)
Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB		Proposed change by the MB	Disposition of Comments
GB	General		ge	Since 19773 is intended to align with 11179, it should not progress beyond CD until it can be determined that all changes introduced during the current revision of 11179 have been accommodated.		Will ballot for FCD text, per WG2.
GB	General		ge	The numerous placeholders should either be used or deleted.		Some placeholders, such as those in 3.2-3.9 need to be kept there to keep the ordering correct for future amendments.
GB	General		ge	There is a strong dependency on the conformance specification from ISO/IEC 20944-1, which has not progressed from first CD since late 2005.		The 20944 documents are being balloted as FCD.
GB	General		ed	The numbering of figures is erratic - for example, there are more than one figure labelled "Figure 1", some figures are labelled "Figure x", some figures are unlabelled.		Will ask ISO editor to fix FDIS text.
GB	Introduction		ed	There is a missing word in the opening sentence.	Amend to read "The International Standard specifies small modules of data that can be used or reused in applications."	Will make change.
GB	3.10, 3.11, 3.12, 3.13, 3.16, 3.17		ed	The introductory sentence currently reads "The following are additional definitions from Module []." Are these definitions taken from the relevant modules, or definitions provided here for use in the modules?	Amend to read "The following are additional definitions for Module []."	Will make change.
GB	11.4.2.1	Figure 1	ed	The figure obscures some nearby text.		Will make change.
GB	11.4.3.1	Figure 1	ed	The figure is incorrectly placed.		Will make change.
GB	12.4.3.1	Figure 2	ed	The figure obscures some nearby text.		Will make change.

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table / Note #	Comment type ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Proposed Disposition of Comments
0001	US	3		te	Better structure for 3.X for "Placeholder ..."		Will ask ISO editor for advice.
0002	US	7.1		te	Need clarify how a non-consecutive range is specified.	Use commas, such as 2-4,7-9.	Will explain.
0003	US	7.2		ed	Need appropriate reference to Clause 8.		Will make change.
0004	US	8		te	Need to have boilerplate wording for profiles.		Will make change.
0005	US	10		te	Investigate the possibility of using inheritance for the type structure.		Will investigate.
0006	US	12.3.3		te	Fix component "data" to be the one in the type definition later on in the clause.		Will make change.
0007	US	12.4		ed	Fix diagram misplaced at the bottom of page 43.		Will make change.
0008	US	11,12		te	Can multivalued, multidata, multistring, multitext, be consolidated into 3 types: multivalued, multistring, multidata?		No, need 4 separate types.
0009	US	13.4.2		te	Need additional row in table.	Add after second row: dkv_tuple_as_tttXX characterstring characterstring multistring For text-only applications.	Will make change.
0010	US	14		te	The dkv_array should be dkv_table, which the designation should be the key.		Will make change.
0010	US	16.4.2		te	Remove double diamonds.		Will make change.
0011	US	16.4.3.2		te	The figures should be sequentially numbered, check all figures and tables.		Will ask ISO editor to fix in FDIS text.
0012	US	16.4.4.1		ed	Typo "conctentalized_renderend_postal_address" => "contextualized_renderend_postal_address"		Will make change.
0013	US	16.5.2		te	Change "multidata" to "multitext", see corresponding diagram		Will make change.
0014	US	16.5.2		ed	Typo "contextaulized_unrendered_postal_class" => "contextualized_unrendered_postal_class"		Will make change.

¹ NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by **)

² Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory. ISO electronic balloting commenting template (enhanced 2002-08)

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table / Note #	Comment type ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Proposed Disposition of Comments
0015	US	16		te	Need clarification on how the different renderings are coordinated in the parallel multitext structure.		Will make change.
0016	US	17.4.2		te	Make figure match datatypes of 17.4.2: multidata (array of ...)		Will make change.
0017	US	18.4.4		ed	Typo "an particular" => "a particular"		Will make change.
0018	US	18.4.4		te	The extent needs to handle unordered dimensions.		Will make change.
0019	US	18.4.4		te	Reword definition of "extent_dimension_metric_array".		Will make change.
0020	US	18.4.4		te	Should reference introduction to 19107 on geometries and topologies: In the model defined in this International Standard, spatial characteristics are described by one or more spatial attributes whose value is given by a geometric object (GM_Object) or a topological object (TP_Object). Geometry provides the means for the quantitative description, by means of coordinates and mathematical functions, of the spatial characteristics of features, including dimension, position, size, shape, and orientation. The mathematical functions used for describing the geometry of an object depend on the type of coordinate reference system used to define the spatial position. Geometry is the only aspect of geographic information that changes when the information is transformed from one geodetic reference system or coordinate system to another. Topology deals with the characteristics of geometric figures that remain invariant if the space is deformed elastically and continuously — for example, when geographic data is transformed from one coordinate system to another. Within the context of geographic		Will make change.

¹ **NB** = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by ******)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial **NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory. *ISO electronic balloting commenting template (enhanced 2002-08)*

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table / Note #	Comment type ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Proposed Disposition of Comments
					information, topology is commonly used to describe the connectivity of an n-dimensional graph, a property that is invariant under continuous transformation of the graph. Computational topology provides information about the connectivity of geometric primitives that can be derived from the underlying geometry		
0021	US	18.4.4		te	Need to have explicit boundary values, not just combined with "other_data"		Will investigate.
0022	US	18.4.4		te	Need to match example with data structure.		Will make change.
0023	US	18.4.4		te	Need example that includes a "who" dimension.		Will make change.
0024	US	19		te	Add E-mail address to contact data.		Will make change.
0025	US	19		te	How does "contact title" in 11179-3 edition 2, map to EPG contact data? Add a note stating that the (functional) title of the individual can be included in the postal data, e.g., "data steward".		Will make change.
0026	US	19		te	Missing definitions of "individual_identification_class" and "organization_identification_class".		Will make change.
0027	US	3.20		te	Remove authentication, replace with credentials.	08.01.14 credentials Data that are transferred to establish the claimed identity of an entity.	Will make change.
0028	US	20		te	Security credentials needs more explanation, i.e., what is a security credential (need to reference SC27 standards and 2382-08).		Will investigate.
0029	US	21		te	Need harmonization and citation of WG1 definitions of entity, person, group, etc., as applicable. Change entity-person-group to person-group.		Will investigate.
0030	US	21		te	Explain that the scope of the references are		Will make change.

¹ **NB** = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial **NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory. ISO electronic balloting commenting template (enhanced 2002-08)

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table / Note #	Comment type ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Proposed Disposition of Comments
					within one group map.		

1 **NB** = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial **NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory. *ISO electronic balloting commenting template (enhanced 2002-08)*