

# ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N 1618

Date: 2007-06-27

REPLACES: --

<p><b>ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32</b></p> <p><b>Data Management and Interchange</b></p> <p><b>Secretariat: United States of America (ANSI)</b> <b>Administered by Farance Inc. on behalf of ANSI</b></p>
--

<b>DOCUMENT TYPE</b>	Meeting Report
<b>TITLE</b>	SC32 New York Meeting - Vocabulary <i>ad hoc</i> Report
<b>SOURCE</b>	Vocabulary ad hoc Rapporteur - Jake Knoppers
<b>PROJECT NUMBER</b>	1.32.
<b>STATUS</b>	Meeting Notes/Vocabulary ad hoc report and proposed plenary resolutions. For review at New York meeting of SC32
<b>REFERENCES</b>	
<b>ACTION ID.</b>	FYI
<b>REQUESTED ACTION</b>	for review at New York meeting of SC32
<b>DUE DATE</b>	
<b>Number of Pages</b>	8
<b>LANGUAGE USED</b>	English
<b>DISTRIBUTION</b>	P & L Members SC Chair WG Conveners and Secretaries

Dr. Timothy Schoechle, Secretary, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32  
Farance Inc \*, 3066 Sixth Street, Boulder, CO, United States of America  
Telephone: +1 303-443-5490; E-mail: [Timothy@Schoechle.org](mailto:Timothy@Schoechle.org)  
available from the JTC 1/SC 32 WebSite <http://www.jtc1sc32.org/>  
\*Farance Inc. administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

**ISO/IEC CAC JTC1/SC32**  
**Document No: 32C137**  
**2007-06-27**

<b>Document Type:</b>	
<b>Document Title:</b>	Draft JTC1/SC32 Position on work of JTC1 Ad-Hoc on Vocabulary and Resolutions to be forwarded to JTC1 Plenary
<b>Document Source:</b>	CAC JTC1/SC32 ( as well as previous JTC1/SC32 and JTC1 Resolutions on this matter)
<b>Project Number:</b>	
<b>Document Status</b>	
<b>Action ID:</b>	For discussion and decision at the JTC1/SC32 Plenary, New York, July, 2007
<b>Due Date:</b>	
<b>Distribution:</b>	JTC1/SC32 P, O & L members
<b>No. of Pages:</b>	7
<b>Notes:</b>	

## 1. CONTEXT AND RATIONALE

1.1 CAC JTC1/SC32 notes that JTC1/SC32 has a long standing policy of advocating making standards available (at little or no cost) thereby facilitating their widespread adoption and use.

1.2 As early as 2001 JTC1/SC32 Plenary Resolution #25 (JTC1/SC32 N0416) requested JTC1 to make publicly available for each of the JTC1/SC32 standards, their:

- Clause 0 – Introduction
- Clause 1 – Scope
- Clause 2 – Normative References
- Clause 3 – Definitions<sup>1</sup>

{See Annex A.1 below for the full text of this JTC1/SC32 Resolution}

1.3 It is noted that JTC1 at its 2001 plenary meeting in response to this JTC1/SC32 Resolution adopted two (2) Resolutions unanimously {See JTC1 N 6607}.

The first of these, Resolution #33 “Facilitating Standards Development and Public Awareness of ISO/IEC JTC1 Standards” adopted the 2001 JTC1/SC32 Plenary Resolution and expanded it {See Annex A.2 below for its full text}.

The second resolution #34 “Request to the Vocabulary Rapporteur” instructed the Vocabulary Rapporteur to pilot the JTC1 terms and standards database” {See Annex A below for its full text}. Unfortunately, this JTC1 set of instructions was not carried out or completed by the JTC1 Vocabulary Rapporteur<sup>2</sup>. However, this is still a valid JTC1 resolution and (urgently) needs to be implemented.

1.4 Again, in 2004, JTC1/SC32 Plenary Resolution #21 – Vocabulary Standards (JTC1/SC32 N1273) in the context of the JTC1 Ad-Hoc on Vocabulary on ISO/IEC 2382 stated that it would participate based on the condition that:

- the three parts of ISO/IEC 2382 are freely available, i.e., Parts 4, 5 and 6; and,
- the contents of the standards are freely distributed. {See Annex A.3 below for the full text of this JTC1/SC32 Resolution}

---

<sup>1</sup> In 2001, the title of sub-clauses and Clause 3 were:

- Clause 3 – Technical normative elements
- Clause 3.1 Terms and definitions
- Clause 3.2 – Symbols and abbreviations.

Clause 3.2 has now become Clause 4 “Symbols and abbreviations”.

<sup>2</sup> It suffices to note here that the then JTC1 Vocabulary Rapporteur instead of implementing this very straight forward JTC1 Resolution #34 decided to add other additional elements while at the same time not implementing the basic fundamental requirements. One result is that this JTC1 resolution was not implemented.

- 1.5 Neither the reports of the JTC1 Ad-Hoc on Vocabulary, nor JTC1 Plenary Resolutions of its 2005 Banff meeting {see JTC1 N8010, Resolution #3} or of its 2006 South Africa meeting {See JTC1 N8426, Resolutions 22 and 23} state that the terms and definitions found in the existing Parts 1-35 of ISO/IEC 2382 will be freely available, i.e., at “No Cost Availability”.

Further, it has not been possible to obtain a clear response on this matter from the JTC1 Ad-Hoc on Vocabulary.

- 1.6 CAC JTC1/SC32 members undertook additional research with respect to identifying previous decisions on this matter. As a result, it is noted that at its 1997 Plenary Meeting (Ottawa), JTC1 adopted plenary resolution #32 {See JTC1 N5018} (with the approval from the ISO and IEC Councils) to place the following documents on the World Wide Web. This JTC1 resolution included “ISO/IEC 2382 (Vocabulary Standards)”. (See Annex A.4 below for the text.)
- 1.7 As such, CAC JTC1/SC32 requests JTC1/SC32 plenary to adopt a resolution(s):
- re-affirming its JTC1/SC32 Berlin Resolution pertaining to making the contents of the multipart ISOIEC 2382 freely available as a condition for its participation in and support of the JTC1 Ad-Hoc on Vocabulary;
  - noting the 1997 JTC1 resolution to make the contents of ISO/IEC 2382 multipart standard freely available; and,
  - recommending that if ISO/IEC 2382 is not made freely available, that JTC1 suspend the work of the JTC1 Ad-Hoc until such time as this issue is fully resolved.

## 2. PROPOSED (DRAFT) TEXT FOR JTC1/SC32 RESOLUTIONS

### Draft text for Resolution #n1:

Noting that:

1. JTC1/SC32 resolved to make its participation in the work of the JTC1 Ad-Hoc on Vocabulary re: the ISOIEC 2382 standards conditional on their content being freely distributable {SC32N1273, Resolution #21}'
2. JTC1 already in 1997 resolved to make the ISO/IEC 2382 standards freely available (via the World Wide Web) {JTC1 N5018, Resolution #32};
3. JTC1 also resolved in 2001:
  - in its Resolution #33 to make the contents of what are now Clauses 0 through 4 of its standards publicly and freely available, i.e. now (1) Clause 0 Introduction (informative and optional); (2) Clause 1 Scope; (3) Clause 2 Normative References; (4) Clause 3 Definitions; and (5) Clause 4 Symbols and abbreviations; and,
  - in its Resolution #34 basically instructed its JTC1 Vocabulary Rapporteur to pilot a JTC1 terms and standards database, i.e., all the contents of Clause 2 Normative References and Clause 3 Definitions, on a “no cost availability” basis.

4. neither the JTC1 Ad-Hoc Vocabulary documents nor JTC1 Plenary 2005 or 2006 Resolutions clearly state that the ISO/IEC 2382 standards will be freely available, i.e., "at No Cost Availability";

JTC1/SC32 requests JTC1 Plenary to either:

- 1) re-affirm its 1997 Plenary decision to make the contents of ISO/IEC 2382 standards freely available/distributable; or,
- 2) if not, suspend the work of the JTC1 Ad-Hoc Vocabulary until this matter be resolved in a manner consistent with the JTC1 1997 Plenary Resolution.

**Draft text for Resolution #n2:**

JTC1/SC32 also requests that JTC1 take a wider perspective and re-affirm its 2001 Plenary Resolutions #33 and #34 in which the mandate of the JTC1 AD-Hoc on Vocabulary would be expanded to include all the terms and definitions in all the JTC1 standards in order to (1) collate them into a single JTC1 terms / definitions database; and, (2) provide access to the same on a "No Cost Availability" basis via the World Wide Web.

## Annex A

### A.1 Quoting JTC1/SC32 Plenary Resolution #25 of its 2001-01-28 Santa Fe Plenary Meeting (document SC32 N0416)

#### **“Resolution 25: Facilitating Standards Development Work & Marketing ISO/IEC JTC1/SC32 Standards**

SC32 requests its JTC1 secretariat to make publicly available on the ISO and ITTF Web sites the following clauses for each of the JTC 1/SC32 standards, namely:

- Clause 0.0 Introduction
- Clause 1.0 Scope
- Clause 2.0 Normative References
- Clause 3.0 Definitions, Notations and Conventions

Having such JTC1/SC32 information publicly available has several benefits including:

- facilitating standards development work both within JTC1 and those outside of JTC1 standards. Having such information readily available assists in minimizing duplication work, identifying use of standards in other standards, and maximizing re-use of existing standards (e.g. existing terms and definitions).
- serving as a means for marketing JTC1 standards by providing information deemed to be essential for access and discovery of such standards by potential users.

Further JTC 1/SC32 requests JTC 1 to consider:

*bringing forward this JTC1/SC32 resolution as one which JTC 1 should consider at its next Plenary as being applicable to all ISO/IEC JTC 1 standards; and following a one year test period for ISO/IEC JTC 1 standards, consider this for general applicability to all ISO and IEC standards.*

Voted and Accepted

Unanimous

### A.2 Quoting JTC1 2001 Plenary Resolutions #33 and #34 in response to JTC1/SC32 Plenary Resolution #25

As taken from the JTC1 2001 Plenary Resolution document JTC1 N66 07

#### **“Resolution #33: Facilitating Standards Development and Public Awareness of ISO/IEC JTC1 Standards**

*To facilitate standards development and public awareness of ISO/IEC JTC1 standards, JTC1 recommends to the ISO Market Project Task Force that ISO and IEC permit the making publicly available on the ISO and ITTF Web sites and/or permit its P-member bodies to make publicly available on their Web sites, the contents of the following clauses for each of the ISO/IEC JTC1 standards; namely:*

*Clause 0 Introduction*

*Clause 1 Scope*

*Clause 2 Normative references*

*Clause 3 Technical normative elements*

*3.1 Terms and definitions*

*3.2 Symbols and abbreviations.*

*Having such information on JTC1 standards publicly available has several benefits including:*

- 1) facilitating standards development work both within JTC1 and those outside of JTC1 standards. Having such information readily available assists in minimizing duplication work, identifying use of standards in other standards, and maximizing re-use of existing standards, (e.g., existing terms and definitions) in other standards development work.*
- 2) serving as a means for facilitating public awareness of JTC1 standards by providing information deemed to be essential for access and discovery of such standards by potential users (who then hopefully will acquire them for their needs).*

*The reasons for focusing and restricting this resolution to only Clauses 0 through 3 are that:*

- 1) Clause 0 is informative and optional*
- 2) Clause 1 allows a prospective user to determine the focus of the standard*
- 3) Clause 2 identifies other, supporting, standards*
- 4) Clause 3 in providing terms and definitions will encourage and facilitate other standards developers to (re-) use them*
- 5) Clauses 4+ containing the substantive content of a standard and therefore are excluded from this resolution.*

*It is understood that ISO and ITTF and/or JTC1 P-Member bodies in making the contents of Clauses 0 through 3 publicly available will incorporate ISO/IEC requirements on copyright and do so in a visible manner.*

*Unanimous”*

#### **“Resolution #34: Request to the Vocabulary Rapporteur**

*JTC1 instructs the Vocabulary Rapporteur send out for comment the draft user guidelines and URL for the online database. JTC1 further instructs that the Vocabulary Rapporteur contact SC secretariats to pilot the JTC1 term and standards database. SCs that agree to join the pilot are requested to obtain the admin password from the Vocabulary Rapporteur and to maintain their terms directly. JTC1 instructs the Vocabulary Rapporteur to provide a report to the next JTC1 plenary meeting with the results of the ISO/TC211 trial and the JTC1 trail. The Vocabulary Rapporteur is instructed to supply copies of the current work to the JTC1 Secretariat.*

*Unanimous”*

#### **A.3 Quoting JTC1/SC32 Plenary Resolution #21 of its 2005-04-22 Berlin Plenary Meeting (document SC32 N1273)**

##### **“Resolution 21: Resolution on ISO/IEC 2382**

*The following standards that relate to ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 work are now the responsibility of ISO/IEC JTC 1:*

*ISO/IEC 2382 Vocabulary Standards*

*ISO/IEC 2382-4:1999 Information technology – Vocabulary – Part 4: Organization of data*

*ISO/IEC 2382-5:1999 Information technology – Vocabulary – Part 5: Representation of data*

*ISO/IEC 2382-6:1987 Information technology – Vocabulary – Part 6: Preparation and handling of data*

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 volunteers to accept the transfer of these three standards project parts from the ISO/IEC JTC 1 program of work to the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 program of work under the following conditions:

- The three parts of ISO/IEC 2382 are freely available.
- The content of the standards are freely distributable.

Rationale: We expect these terms and definitions to be used in concept systems that may be widely distributed for semantic based computing and the semantic web.

Voted and Rejected

5 - YES

0 - NO

3 - Abstain

“

#### **A.4 Quoting JTC1 1997 (Ottawa) Plenary**

##### **“Resolution #32: Release of Standards**

“JTC1 instructs its Secretariat to request approval from the ISO and IEC Councils to place the following documents on the World Wide Web:

- .....
- 2. ISO/IEC 2382 (Vocabulary Standards)
- .....”

Voted

USA, Germany: Abstain